

COOLEY LLP
HEIDI L. KEEFE (178960) (hkeefe@cooley.com)
RONALD S. LEMIEUX (120822) (rlemieux@cooley.com)
MARK R. WEINSTEIN (193043) (mweinstein@cooley.com)
KYLE D. CHEN (239501) (kyle.chen@cooley.com)
Five Palo Alto Square, 4th Floor
3000 El Camino Real
Palo Alto, California 94306-2155
Telephone: (650) 843-5000
Facsimile: (650) 857-0663

Attorneys for Plaintiffs
HTC CORPORATION AND HTC AMERICA, INC.

[See signature page for additional counsel]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

HTC CORPORATION, HTC AMERICA,
INC.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

TECHNOLOGY PROPERTIES
LIMITED, PATRIOT SCIENTIFIC
CORPORATION, and ALLIACENSE
LIMITED,

Defendants.

Case No. 5:08-cv-00882 PSG

**JOINT REQUEST TO DISMISS ALL
CLAIMS RELATING TO U.S. PATENT
NO. 5,530,890 UNDER F.R.C.P. 41(a)(2)**

[PROPOSED] ORDER THEREON

The Honorable Paul S. Grewal

WHEREAS plaintiffs HTC Corporation and HTC America, Inc. (collectively “HTC”) filed a First Amended Complaint seeking a declaratory judgment that HTC does not infringe any valid and enforceable claim of U.S. Patent No. 5,530,890 (the “’890 patent”);

WHEREAS defendants Technology Properties Limited, Patriot Scientific Corporation, and Alliacense Limited (collectively “Defendants”) filed an Answer and Counterclaim denying HTC’s averment that HTC did not infringe any valid and enforceable claim of the ’890 patents,

1 and asserting a counterclaim of infringement regarding the '890 patent;

2 **WHEREAS** the '890 patent was subject to *ex parte* reexamination with a reexamination
3 certificate issuing on March 1, 2011;

4 **WHEREAS** on September 17, 2013, the Court issued an order granting-in-part HTC's
5 motion for summary judgment based on the intervening rights doctrine, concluding that "any
6 claims of infringement before the date of the issuance of the reexamination certificate [of the '890
7 patent] must be precluded" (Dkt. No. 585, at 20:17-18) ("Summary Judgment Order");

8 **WHEREAS** the HTC products accused of infringing of the '890 patent did not generate
9 revenue in the United States in 2011 or thereafter;

10 **WHEREAS** based on the Summary Judgment Order and the HTC products accused of
11 infringing the '890 patent in the present action, Defendants cannot establish entitlement to
12 damages under any claim of the '890 patent under 35 U.S.C. § 284;

13 **WHEREAS** Defendants respectfully believe that the Summary Judgment Order is
14 erroneous with respect to intervening rights on the '890 patent, and reserve their right to seek
15 review by the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit after entry of final judgment in this
16 action;

17 **WHEREAS** in order to conserve judicial resources and streamline these proceedings, and
18 without prejudice to the rights of any party to appeal all or part of the Summary Judgment Order
19 or any other order for which an appeal is permissible, the parties respectfully request that the
20 Court order, as follows:

21
22 **1.** Because Defendants cannot establish entitlement to damages in the present action
23 based on the Summary Judgment Order, the Court hereby **DISMISSES** the Fifth Claim for Relief
24 in HTC's First Amended Complaint (seeking a declaration that HTC does not infringe any valid
25 and enforceable claim of the '890 patent), and Count IV of Defendants' Answer and
26 Counterclaim (alleging infringement of the '890 patent), subject to the conditions of this Order.

27 **2.** This Order shall not affect any other claim or counterclaim asserted in the present
28

KIRBY NOONAN LACE & HOGE

By: /s/ Charles T. Hoge
Charles T. Hoge, State Bar No. 110696
choge@knlh.com

Attorneys for Defendant
PATRIOT SCIENTIFIC CORPORATION

FILER'S ATTESTATION

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5.1(i)(3), the undersigned attests that James C. Otteson and Charles T. Hoge have concurred in the filing of this Joint Request to Dismiss All Claims Relating to U.S. Patent No. 5,530,890 Under F.R.C.P. 41(a)(2).

Dated: September 18, 2013

COOLEY LLP

By: /s/ Mark R. Weinstein

1 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

2
3 Dated: _____

4 _____
5 Honorable Paul S. Grewal
6 United States Magistrate Judge

7 1172697 v1/HN
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28